

## Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel

Meeting 13

Date: 6<sup>th</sup> December 2007

Location: Le Capelain Room, States Building

Present                    Deputy A. Breckon, Chairman  
                                 Deputy J.A. Martin, Vice Chairman  
                                 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier

Apologies                Deputy S. Power

In attendance           Mr C Ahier, Scrutiny Officer  
                                 Mr M Orbell, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	<p><b>1. Minutes of previous meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel approved minutes of the meeting of 8<sup>th</sup> October 2007</p>	
	<p><b>2. Matters arising</b></p> <p><b>Chairman and Panel Members' Actions</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that it would address these actions under separate agenda items.</p>	
	<p><b>3. Forthcoming Propositions</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that 'P176/2007/ - Flu Pandemic funding' and 'P176/2007/Com. – Flu Pandemic Funding (P.176-2007) – comments.' had in fact been debated in the States on the 5<sup>th</sup> December. It was further noted that the following propositions had subsequently been lodged for debate by the States on the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2008:</p> <p>P180/2007/ - Employment Tribunal – appointment of members                      Minister for Social Security</p> <p>P181/2007/ - Draft Income Support (Special Payments) (Cold Weather Payments) (Jersey) Regulations 200-                      Minister for Social Security</p> <p>P182/2007/ Draft Income Support (Amendment) (Jersey) Regulations 200-                      Minister for Social Security</p> <p>P186/2007/ - Draft Employment Relations (Registration) (Jersey) Regulations 200-                      Minister for Social Security</p>	
	<p><b>4. Questions to Ministers</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the forthcoming arrangements for questions without notice to Ministers.</p>	

	<p><b>CURRENT REVIEWS:</b></p> <p><b>5. Telephone Mast Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>a) The Panel received and noted a paper detailing the Ministerial responses to the report received to date. The Panel noted that the conclusion of the review had been delayed due to the former Minister for Health &amp; Social Services' failure to provide comments before his departure.</p> <p>b) The Panel noted the report entitled 'Report to further review Mobile Phones and perceived Health Effects' received from Health Protection, Public Health Services. The Panel further noted the report from the Minister for Economic Development: 'R102/2007 Telecommunications (Jersey) Law 2002: Direction and Guidance to the JCRA under Article 8' considered by the States on 27<sup>th</sup> October 2007. The Panel discussed the issue of SAR ratings and considered whether this was an area for further investigation. There was further discussion regarding the impact on both male and female fertility as a result of the use of lap top computers. The Panel noted that small masts, some of which located within buildings, were not subject to a requirement for planning permission. As such, the Panel discussed the possible potential consequences of exposure to these masts for the public at large. The Panel agreed to reconvene the Sub-Panel at the earliest opportunity in order for them to review progress against their recommendations and assess whether or not to conclude the review.</p>	
	<p><b>6. Income Support Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>The Panel was informed that the Sub-Panel would need to continue its review into 2008 in order to monitor the implementation of Income Support. It was noted that the monitoring of the implementation was likely to require a less intensive approach than previously adopted. It was further noted that though some Public Hearings were likely the Sub-Panel would not require an expert adviser. The Panel noted that only Deputy Martin and Deputy Southern remained as members of the Sub-Panel. It was confirmed that the Chairman would be seeking at least one new member in the early part of 2008.</p> <p>The Panel noted that the Sub-Panel intended to meet in early January 2008 to identify the particular areas that required close monitoring during the introduction of Income Support. The Panel noted that some areas of concern had already been identified: the number of visits to General Practitioners; as well as the service to job-seekers from the Employment Services Centre. It was felt that it may be appropriate to seek 'outside' opinions on progress by June or July 2008.</p>	
	<p><b>7. Housing Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>a) The Panel noted that the differences of opinions between the Sub-Panel and the Housing Department had prevented</p>	

	<p>agreement being reached on the appropriate direction of the proposed review. It was noted that the Housing Department did not consider it necessary to commission a more thorough housing survey. The Panel were informed that the Sub-Panel disagreed with this view. The Panel considered the Housing Department's approach to selling off the States housing stock. They discussed the apparent absence of a structured approach to both property valuation and the selection of tenants to offer property for purchase. It was noted by the Panel that the Sub-Panel had previously made recommendations in this area to the effect that a structured and transparent approach should be adopted. The Panel agreed to request from the Housing Department an update on their progress with the maintenance programme.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that recent Ministerial decisions related to this area should be collated and sent to the Sub-Panel members for their consideration.</p> <p>b) The Panel received information from the Chairman relating to the standard and availability of accommodation for the over 55s in Jersey. The Panel also received and noted the Planning and Environment Department's consultation report 'Review of the island plan to rezone land for life-long retirement dwellings for the over 55s' and first time buyer homes'. It was agreed to reconvene the Sub-Panel in order to consider the report and submit comments by the 28<sup>th</sup> January 2008 consultation deadline. The Panel suggested that the meeting be scheduled on one of the following dates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Wednesday 12<sup>th</sup> December - pm</li> <li>• Thursday 13<sup>th</sup> December – am</li> <li>• Friday 14<sup>th</sup> December – am</li> <li>• Monday 17<sup>th</sup> December – anytime</li> </ul>	<p>CAMO</p> <p>CAMO</p> <p>CAMO</p>
	<p><b>8. R105/2007 – Machinery of Government Review</b></p> <p>The Panel discussed R105/2007 – Machinery of Government Review and noted that it would be considered by the Chairmen's Committee on Friday 7<sup>th</sup> December. The Panel were informed that Deputy Le Herissier's comments had already been forwarded to the Scrutiny Office. It was agreed that these comments would be re-sent to the Panel's Officers for reference.</p> <p>The Panel noted that the Privileges and Procedures Committee had agreed to form a sub-group to give further consideration to R105/2007. As such, the Panel agreed that the sub-group's consideration would be likely to render obsolete any comments the Panel might offer at this time.</p>	
	<p><b>FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME:</b></p> <p><b>9. Health &amp; Social Services</b></p> <p>a) The Panel noted that the Minister for Health &amp; Social Services had reviewed 'New Directions' and had requested that the Department develop a draft budget for the</p>	

	<p>proposals. It was further noted that the Department had confirmed that the revised version of 'New Directions' and the related budget would be available to the Panel by the end of 2007. The Panel agreed that the review of 'New Directions' could not be progressed until the revised version had been received.</p> <p>b) The Panel noted the Chairman's suggested amendments to the scoping document for the review of Long Term Care and agreed that they should be incorporated into a revised document. The Panel agreed that Deputy Le Herissier should be delegated responsibility to finalise both the Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the review. It was further agreed that the finalised documents could subsequently be shared with the Health &amp; Social Services Minister and Department officers. The Panel discussed whether to progress the review as a full Panel or form a Sub-Panel and considered possible areas of conflict for Deputy Power as a result of his involvement as Chairman with the Housing Property Plan Sub-Panel and his membership of the Planning Applications Panel. It was agreed to progress the review as a Sub-Panel comprising: Deputy Le Herissier; Deputy Breckon; Deputy Martin; and, subject to an approach from Deputy Le Herissier, either the Connétable of St. John or St. Peter. The Panel discussed the review budget and agreed that a similar amount would be required to that previously agreed for the proposed review of 'New Directions'. Accordingly, the Panel agreed that £30,000 be earmarked for the review.</p> <p>i. The Panel agreed to consider Advisers recommended by the Health &amp; Social Services Department. It was further agreed to seek confirmation as to which Advisers the Department recommended.</p> <p>ii. The Panel noted that a member of the public had made a submission to the Panel by telephone in respect of local dental charges. It was further noted that although the individual had not left his full name or contact details he was known to members of the Scrutiny Office from previous submissions. The Panel also noted that the Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority had recently conducted a review of dental pricing. The Panel went on to consider a short, focussed review of dental treatment and its related areas. The Panel agreed to develop a draft scoping document and Terms of Reference for further consideration.</p>	<p>CAMO</p> <p>CAMO</p> <p>CAMO RLH</p> <p>CAMO</p> <p>CAMO</p>
	<p><b>10. Social Security</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the latest request for statistical information had been acknowledged by the Social Security Department and that the matter had been delegated to another member of staff as the</p>	

	<p>Scrutiny Liaison Officer would be moving to the Chief Minister's Department at the start of 2008.</p> <p>The Panel noted that the review of the Migration Policy by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Sub-Panel: Migration Policy would be likely to overlap with the HSSH Panel's remit. The Panel agreed that Deputy Martin, being a member also of the Sub-Panel, would share the scoping document and terms of reference with the Panel and inform of review progress where relevant.</p>	
	<p><b>11. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that members were off island or unavailable on the following dates in December and January:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Deputy Breckon – 18<sup>th</sup> December to approximately 6<sup>th</sup> January</li> <li>• Deputy Le Herissier – 7<sup>th</sup> January to approximately 13<sup>th</sup> January</li> <li>• Deputy Martin – 22<sup>nd</sup> December to approximately 2<sup>nd</sup> January</li> </ul> <p>a) The Panel agreed to meet at 9:30am on Tuesday 8<sup>th</sup> January</p> <p>b) The Panel further agreed to diarise meetings at 9:30am every other Tuesday from 8<sup>th</sup> January 2008.</p>	

Signed

Date

.....  
Chairman, Health, Social Security and Housing Panel